## IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA NEWPORT NEWS DIVISION Criminal No. 4:16-cr-16

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA	)
v.	)
EDWARD JOSEPH MATISH III,	)
Defendant.	) ) )

## REPLY BRIEF IN SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE BRIEF OF AMICUS CURIAE ELECTRONIC FRONTIER FOUNDATION

The Electronic Frontier Foundation ("EFF") respectfully offers this brief response in support of its motion to file an *amicus* brief in the above captioned matter.

Contrary to the government's suggestion, criminal cases do not present unique problems for the participation of *amicus curiae*. Instead, as in any case, the participation of *amicus* is left to the sound discretion of the district court. *Tafas v. Dudas*, 511 F. Supp. 2d 652, 659 (E.D. Va. 2007).

As EFF noted in its initial motion, however, this case *does* present novel and complex questions of technology and constitutional law, areas in which EFF has unique experience, perspective, and interest. Indeed, EFF has served as *amicus curiae* at the federal district court level in numerous criminal cases involving complex questions of technology and law (like the case here). *See, e.g., United States v. Cassidy*, 11-cr-00091 (D. Md. 2011) (*amicus* in case concerning First Amendment implications of prosecution based on an alleged threat made through Twitter); *United States v. Fricosu*, 841 F. Supp. 2d 1232 (D. Colo. 2012) (*amicus* in case concerning Fifth Amendment implications of compelled decryption of laptop); *United States v. Decryption of a Seized Data Storage System*, 2:13-mj-449-RTR (D. Wis. 2013) (same); *United* 

States v. Hasbajrami, 11-cr-623 (E.D.N.Y. 2011) (amicus in case considering Fourth

Amendment implications of prosecution based on information obtained through electronic

surveillance under the FISA Amendments Act); United States v. Vargas, 13-cr-06025 (E.D.

Wash. 2013) (amicus, at invitation of the court, in criminal prosecution based on evidence

obtained through warrantless 24-hour video surveillance of the home).

It bears emphasizing that EFF does not here—nor did it in *United States v. Lorente*, 15-

cr-00274 (W.D. Wash.)—advocate on behalf of the defendant, as the government suggests. See

Gov. Opp. at 6. Rather, EFF's interest in all cases is the sound application of constitutional

principles in light of new technology, not the interests of any particular defendant. It is for

precisely this reason that EFF's participation as amicus curiae is valuable to the Court—EFF

does not share the same specific interest in this case as either the Government or the Defendant.

Finally, EFF acted expeditiously in preparing and filing its brief for the Court's

consideration. EFF only became aware of the case on April 27; EFF reached out to the

government to express its interest in filing an amicus brief on May 3; and EFF filed its brief less

than a week later, on May 9.

For these reasons, and those set forth in its opening brief, EFF respectfully offers its

participation as *amicus curiae* and urges the Court to grant its motion for leave to file.

This the 11th day of May 2016.

**ELECTRONIC FRONTIER FOUNDATION** 

 $/_{\rm S}/$ 

James R. Theuer, VSB #68712

JAMES R. THEUER, PLLC 555 E. Main St., Suite 1212

Norfolk, VA 23510

Telephone: (757) 446-8047

Facsimile: (757) 446-8048 jim@theuerlaw.com

Mark Rumold (pro hac application pending) ELECTRONIC FRONTIER FOUNDATION 815 Eddy Street San Francisco, CA 94109

Attorneys for *Amicus Curiae*Electronic Frontier Foundation

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I certify that on the 11th day of May, 2016, I will electronically file the foregoing with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF system, which will then send a notification of such filing (NEF) to:

Andrew W. Grindrod Assistant Federal Public Defender Office of the Federal Public Defender 150 Bousch Street, Suite 403 Norfolk, VA 23510 andrew grindrod@fd.org Kaitlin C. Gratton Assistant United States Attorney United States Attorney's Office (Newport News) 721 Lakefront Commons, Suite 300 Newport News, VA 23606 kaitlin.gratton@usdoj.gov

101

James R. Theuer, VSB #68712 JAMES R. THEUER, PLLC 555 E. Main St., Suite 1212 Norfolk, VA 23510 Telephone: (757) 446-8047

Facsimile: (757) 446-8048

jim@theuerlaw.com